

TERMÍN: 09.01.2022

xx24153xx
Recenzia C
Štěpán Jurajda
stepan.jurajda@cerge-ei.cz

*Prosím nezasahujte do této tabulky*

RECENZENT/KA (meno a priezvisko, pozícia, inštitúcia): **Štěpán Jurajda**NÁZOV MATERIÁLU: **Job Retention Scheme in Slovakia: Impact on Dismissals and Firm Survival in the COVID-19 Pandemic**TYP VÝSTUPU\*[1]: **Analýza**

(pri spoločných výstupoch uviesť aj typy individuálnych vkladov):

ANALYTICKÝ ÚTVAR, REZORT: **Ministerstvo práce, sociálnych vecí a rodiny SR - Inštitút sociálnej politiky**AUTORI/KY: **Matěj Bělín, Marcela Veselková;**

SPOLUAUTORI/KY: - - ; - - ; - - ; - -

RECENZNÝ FORMÁT\*[2]: **2****PRIPOMIENKY:**

P.č	Pripomenka sa vzťahuje k (strana, odsek):	Text pripomienky*[3]	Odôvodnenie pripomienky	Vysporiadanie sa s pripomienkou*[4]
1	Results section	I suggest that the empirical analysis additionally explores the sensitivity of the findings to defining treatment as early-pandemic entry into the program (treatment) group, as opposed to entry into treatment that response to a current spike in covid cases in one's district.	These two types of treatment assignment (early on as opposed to in response to a covid spike) may correspond to different levels of selection on unobservables. Perhaps the interaction effects will be similar across the two groups, alleviating such concerns.	In response to the comment, we estimated the model with firms that were un-treated at most 1 month over the sample period. Results in Appendix D show nearly

				double treatment effects compared to our baseline, which is consistent with the fact that our baseline considers firms as treated even in periods when they are not.
2	Results section	I would also love to see more information about industry-specific effects.	Hospitality industries were clearly affected in a different fashion compared to manufacturing. And these industries could be more sensitive to local covid spikes; hence I would re-run the preferred specification by industry groups.	Following the comment, we dis-aggregate reaction profiles by NACE chapters and show that indeed, hospitality experienced larger effects than other sectors (Figure 6).
3				
4				
5				
6				
7				

8				
9				
10				

**CELKOVÉ HODNOTENIE (recenzent/ka vyplní túto časť po vysporiadaní sa s pripomienkami analytickou jednotkou):**

It is important to assess the effectiveness of furlough and employment support during the pandemic. This is fundamentally difficult in most countries, however, since there is typically no quasi-random variation in the availability of kurzarbeit (or similar) support. It is thus not possible to evaluate the effect of job support at the national level. The study performs an exercise focused on local-level mechanisms that could be informative about the causal nexus between job support and dismissals or firm survival. The study focuses on small firms in Slovakia and asks whether firms that (at least briefly) draw support from the "First help" program react differently to temporary spikes in the local intensity of the pandemic. The findings are interpreted in favour of the "First help" scheme. Ultimately, this is a competently performed study that provides useful evidence on this important program. I would suggest that the interpretation of the findings is as carefully worded as possible. The authors have successfully responded to all of my comments.

---

[1] Výber medzi: 1. analýza (komplexný analytický materiál s návrhmi konkrétnych systémových opatrení); 2. komentár (rozsahovo menší analytický materiál venujúci sa konkrétnemu čiastkovému problému); 3. manuál (metodické usmernenie vyplývajúce z potreby zjednotenia procesov a postupov v konkrétnej oblasti).

[2] Formát 1 pre komentár/manuál (2 recenzenti bez povinného odborného workshopu); Formát 2 pre analýzu (3 recenzenti a povinný odborný workshop).

[3] Do tabuľky značiť pripomienky zásadného metodologického a obsahového charakteru (nie štylistické či gramatické opravy).

[4] Vyplní analytická jednotka: pripomienka bola akceptovaná / pripomienka nebola akceptovaná a zdôvodnenie / pripomienka bola čiastočne akceptovaná a zdôvodnenie.